

מאיירס - ג'זינט - מכון ברזקדייל  
MYERS - JDC - BROOKDALE INSTITUTE  
مايرس - جوينت - معهد بروكديل



**CENTER FOR RESEARCH ON DISABILITIES  
AND EMPLOYMENT OF SPECIAL POPULATIONS**

**Maavarim (Transitions):  
Rural Employment Center  
in the Bedouin Sector in  
the Negev – Khura and Segev Shalom  
Evaluation Report**

Judith King ♦ Rachel Raanan

The study was initiated and funded by JDC-TEVET

Maavarim was generously supported by  
The Maurice and Vivienne Wohl Charitable Foundation in memory  
of the late Maurice and Vivienne Wohl of Geneva and London



RR-591-11

**RESEARCH REPORT**

**Maavarim (Transitions):  
Rural Employment Center in the Bedouin Sector  
in the Negev – Khura and Segev Shalom  
Evaluation Report**

Judith King

Rachel Raanan

The study was initiated and funded by JDC-TEVET

Maavarim was generously supported by  
The Maurice and Vivienne Wohl Charitable Foundation  
in memory of the late Maurice and Vivienne Wohl of Geneva and London

Editor: Mati Moyal/Jenny Rosenfeld

English translation (executive summary): Naomi Halsted

Layout and print production: Leslie Klineman

Myers-JDC-Brookdale Institute

P.O.B. 3886

Jerusalem 91037, Israel

Tel: (02) 655-7400

Fax: (02) 561-2391

Website: [www.jdc.org.il/brookdale](http://www.jdc.org.il/brookdale)



## Related Myers-JDC-Brookdale Institute Publications

Habib, J.; King, J.; Ben Shoham, A.; Wolde-Tsadick, A.; Lasky, K. 2010. "Labor Market and Socio-Economic Outcomes of the Arab-Israeli Population." *OECD Social, Employment and Migration Working Papers* No. 102, [www.oecd.org/els/workingpapers](http://www.oecd.org/els/workingpapers)

Hassan Daher, S. and Strosberg, N. 2011. *Eshet Chayil and Avihayil for the Arab Population: Evaluation Study*. RR-584-11 (Hebrew).

King, J.; Naon, D.; Wolde-Tsadick, A.; Habib, J. 2009. *Employment of Arab Women Aged 18–64: Executive Summary*. ES-31-09. The full report (in Hebrew) is available on the Institute website.

Naon, D.; King, J.; Wolde-Tsadick, A. 2006. *Populations not Fully Participating in the Labor Market: Extent, Characteristics and Programs to Promote their Employment and Occupational Mobility*. RR-490-06 (Hebrew).

To order publications, please contact the Myers-JDC-Brookdale Institute, P.O.B. 3886, Jerusalem, 91037; Tel: (02) 655-7400; Fax: (02) 561-2391; E-mail: [brook@jdc.org.il](mailto:brook@jdc.org.il)

Reports are also available on the Institute website: [www.jdc.org.il/brookdale](http://www.jdc.org.il/brookdale)

# Maavarim (Transitions): Rural Employment Center in the Bedouin Sector in the Negev – Khura and Segev Shalom *Evaluation Report*

## Executive Summary

### 1. Introduction

The Maavarim (Transitions) Center in the Bedouin sector was built on the model of the Maavarim rural employment center in the Jewish sector, which was created to contend with the socioeconomic crisis that had beset the rural sector for the previous two decades. The model strives to achieve its employment goals through three complementary circles:

- ◆ ***Working with the individual:*** by developing an array of tools to help participants overcome personal barriers to integration into employment, e.g., little human capital and lack of job-seeking skills
- ◆ ***Working through the community:*** by developing mechanisms in the community to help jobseekers, by recruiting community leadership to motivate and assist individuals, by identifying and addressing barriers in the community and by promoting the potential in the community regarding employment
- ◆ ***Working regionally*** (geographic/organizational areas): developing an employment policy and pooling resources; at the same time, mobilizing local social and economic forces in order to strengthen the ability of individuals and of the region to develop their potential for employment.<sup>1</sup>

The program partners are TEVET, the Community Work Service at the Ministry of Social Affairs and Social Services (MoSASS), the Fund for Demonstration Projects at the National Insurance Institute (NII), the local authorities, and the Israel Association of Community Centers, which implements Maavarim throughout the country.

Maavarim is an example of a unique attempt at cultural adaptation of an employment program. It provides a successful model for adjusting employment programs to accommodate the values and norms of Bedouin society. This was done with the full cooperation of the community leadership and the formal and informal institutions of traditional Bedouin society, for maximal integration of Bedouin men and women into employment as wage earners or business entrepreneurs. Maavarim is connected to the regional economic development plan, which adds an economic horizon to its activities. The Center offers each participant a tailor-made service package, including: information about employment opportunities and vocational training; acquisition of job-seeking skills; employment counseling; and the provision of courses to complete schooling and vocational courses.

---

<sup>1</sup> The regional employment center, which corresponds to this circle, had not yet been established when the study was conducted.

<sup>2</sup> Since the Maavarim Center is located in the community center, the participants may not have made the

The report presents the findings of an evaluation of the program in Khura and Segev Shalom (Bedouin localities in the Negev). It comprises two parts, the first of which examines the process of implementing the program in its first two years (2008 and 2009). The second part focuses on the outcomes of the program for the participants.

## **2. Study Design**

The description of the process of implementation is based on documentation, observations of board meetings of the Maavarim Center, and in-depth interviews with the program staff, the program directors at the Israel Association of Community Centers and JDC-TEVET, the mayors of Khura and Segev Shalom, the director of the social service department in Segev Shalom, the director of the community center in Khura, several members of the steering community and members of the *Reshet Meshatefet* (see below). The interviews were conducted between May and August 2009.

To examine the outcomes of the program for the participants, we carried out a quantitative analysis of the findings of telephone interviews conducted in Arabic with 355 residents of the two localities who joined the program between December 2007 and December 2009 (this, according to the computerized database of TEVET). The interviews were conducted in May to June 2010, so that, at the time of interview, between 6 and 30 months had elapsed since the respondents had joined the program.

## **3. Findings**

### **3.1. Evaluation of the Implementation**

The Maavarim Center serves both Khura and Segev Shalom, which share its organizational and professional infrastructure. The formal infrastructure includes the organizational structure, the administrative structure and the professional infrastructure.

#### ***a. Organizational Infrastructure***

The organizational structure of the Maavarim Center consists of two units: the Unit for Individual Service and the Community Unit.

***The head of the Unit for Individual Service*** works mainly on an individual basis with applicants to the center, starting by clarifying expectations and identifying their motivation to work and their skills and preferences. The next stage includes drafting CVs, imparting job-hunting skills, practicing job interviews, empowerment, and defining the applicants' personal vision of employment. He refers applicants to specific jobs (in consultation with the head of employer relations) and follows up by telephone after candidates have been placed. The adult-education and vocational courses, which are included in the center's service package, are provided by the community centers, particularly for women, and are among their regular activities.

The staff of the ***Community Unit*** includes the head of community work, the head of employer relations and the mentors (paraprofessionals). The ***head of community work*** is responsible for

working with all the agencies in the community, both formal and informal, and getting them involved in employment issues. The agencies in question are the neighborhood committee, the *Reshet Meshatefet*, the Council of Women, nonprofit organizations (e.g., Shatil and AJEEC – the Arab-Jewish Center for Equality Empowerment and Cooperation) and the religious leadership. Since the position is held by a woman and she is limited by the norms of Bedouin society in the extent to which she can work directly with community organizations that have male members (e.g., the *Reshet Meshatefet*), she is assisted by the mentors and the heads of the other areas. She works with groups of young people who are not employed and is in charge of planning the community project with the participation of the Ministry of Education, which prepares high school students for post-high school education and entry into the working world. Being the only woman on the staff, she also works with the female participants individually, particularly in Segev Shalom, which does not yet have a Council of Women.

The *mentors* – one in each of the localities – are both male and fully apprised of what is happening in the field since they know all local residents. They advertise the Maavarim Center by distributing bulletins and leaflets at events in their respective localities and at social gatherings such as the *shiq* (see below), as well as through the *Reshet Meshatefet* and the Council of Women. They identify potential program participants and conduct basic one-on-one work with them.

The main task of the *head of employer relations*, obviously, is to find jobs, which he does via the Internet, the State Employment Service, manpower agencies and members of the *Reshet Meshatefet*, and at social events. The job involves developing long-term relationships with employers. Additionally, he has set up a network of some 30 Bedouins who hold key positions at various places of work and who provide him with inside information about job possibilities. In addition, he attends tests conducted for Bedouin candidates during the screening of job applicants so that he can ascertain where they fail and pass on the information to the Unit for Individual Service, which can then prepare candidates better for the screening process. He took the initiative to contact manpower agencies and ask them to conduct separate, culturally sensitive screening tests for Bedouin applicants. He is planning to set up a forum of "friendly employers."

#### ***b. Traditional Community Institutions – Formal and Informal***

Maavarim is unique in that it grew organically out of the socio-cultural and religious values and norms of the Bedouin community in southern Israel, with the support of formal and informal institutions and the leadership of Bedouin society with the goal of promoting employment.

The Maavarim Center has earned the cooperation of the *imams* – a sign that its activities have been granted religious legitimacy. The more open-minded imams have discussed the importance of working and acquiring an occupational skill in their Friday sermons and have approved the posting of advertisements about Maavarim, including those that target women, in mosques. Even the more conservative among them have allowed job advertisements to be posted.

The male members of the Maavarim staff, particularly the mentors, have participated extensively in the *shiq*. This is an assembly of men (including young men), who meet several times a week in the evenings to discuss general community affairs. This setting gives the mentors an opportunity to convey information about the Center and to ascertain the way the wind is blowing in the community.

Maavarim makes use of the natural community leadership – influential people in each extended family – and has created a joint forum of these people in each of the localities, known as the *Reshet Meshatefet*, which it has steered towards a focus on employment. The staff has used the extended family leadership to mediate between the Center and the community – initially, in order to gain legitimacy for the program and subsequently for various aspects of its implementation: persuading members of the extended family who are not employed of the importance of going out to work and referring them to the Center, recruiting employers to the program, finding vacant positions, and sometimes even arranging placements without the Center's intervention.

The volunteer activity of members of the *Reshet Meshatefet* is based on values of loyalty, commitment and the mutual assistance intrinsic to extended families. These values are channeled into helping to promote the integration of family members into employment. To strengthen the status of members of the network, each within his own extended family, and reinforce their effectiveness as recruitment agents for the center, a small proportion of the jobs found by the Maavarim staff are offered to members of the *Reshet Meshatefet* to divide among their own extended families. The *Reshet Meshatefet* is an important resource for the program and is highly valued by the staff. In fact, its members perform a paraprofessional role and, in interview, they expressed the wish to professionalize.

Another community institution "adopted" by the program is the *Council of Women* – the female equivalent of the *Reshet Meshatefet*. The mayor of Khura set up the council in his locality several years ago, while in Segev Shalom, it was still in the process of being set up when the study was conducted. The Council of Women is a mechanism for identifying the needs of women, based on information gathered by the volunteers in the council from the women in their own extended families and as a two-way channel for passing on messages and information. Following an informal "survey of needs," the volunteers concluded that many women would like to work, and this convinced them to work together with Maavarim. The head of the Council of Women, in addition to her voluntary work in that capacity, is employed part time at the community center and is in charge of women's affairs, giving her access to programs for women and the resources to fund them, chiefly in the field of adult education and vocational training.

### *c. Management Structure*

The management structure consists of three bodies: the *steering committee*, the *board* and the *director of the Center*. The most influential and active of these is the board, which comprises the director of the Center, the national director of Maavarim, the community development officer of



Maavarim in the south, and the directors of the social service departments and the community centers in both localities. Previously, the mayors were also on the board.

According to documentation and interviews with committee members, the steering committee includes representatives of government ministries, JDC-TEVET and a number of nonprofit organizations. These sources indicate that the committee has not met as often as planned and has had no impact on the implementation of the program.

The director of the Center administers the staff, engages in staff development and training, chiefly through weekly staff meetings, manages relations and cooperation with key players within Khura and Segev Shalom (the mayors, directors of the social service departments and members of the *Reshet Meshatefet*) and from outside of the localities (the Employment Service, nonprofit organizations and the Ministry of Education). He is also involved with planning the economic development of Khura (and has even been in charge of some aspects of it). He also works individually with applicants to the Center and is involved in the community work.

#### ***d. The Professional Infrastructure***

The professional infrastructure includes:

- ◆ A job database
- ◆ A regularly updated computerized system with details of the participants
- ◆ A Hebrew and Arabic website that includes information for jobseekers (including articles and useful hints) and those interested in vocational training
- ◆ An advertising system, which works through the local press and traditional channels, e.g., by posting notices in strategic places, getting mentioned in Friday sermons and, above all, through interpersonal communication with staff members
- ◆ Staff training and guidance at the weekly staff meetings: This usually takes the form of peer learning about topics relevant to the one-on-one work along with discussions about ongoing work. The members of staff received training from Maavarim's southern district community worker and they participate in in-service training provided by JDC-TEVET and by the Israel Association of Community Centers for the national Maavarim program. Interviews with staff members reveal a need for greater personal counseling and guidance on coping with specific problems in their work.

The Maavarim program in the Bedouin sector has succeeded in creating a community infrastructure to promote employment, which involves the local authority, through the mayor and the director of social services, the community center, the religious leadership and the social leadership. It has also established cooperation from the local community center and the regional Employment Service. Under the leadership of the director of the Center and the guidance of the national director of Maavarim, a dedicated, cooperative and professional staff has developed. The Maavarim Center is also involved in economic development programs in both localities, adding an economic horizon to its activities.

In the first two years of implementation, the working practices of the staff typically relied on the traditional norms and values of Bedouin society and they were based on personal ties. The differentiation among staff positions was minimal or moderate. This helped the Center to acquire legitimacy among the residents of Khura and Segev Shalom and to achieve many of the goals it set itself when it was created. Now that the Center has become established, and given the chances for a breakthrough in the employment of residents since the Employment Center for the Bedouin in the Negev – Rayan ("fertile ground") was established, with the help of government funding, the Maavarim Center is expected to expand its collaborations with government ministries and other local, non-Bedouin, agencies. In light of this development, the Center needs to formalize its work practices, e.g., through clear job descriptions, activities based on professional rather than personal criteria and considerations, formal decision-making processes, fixed work procedures and proper documentation (minutes and reports).

### **3.2 Evaluation of the Outcomes for the Program Participants**

#### ***a. Demographic Characteristics and Employment Resources and Barriers among the Participants***

As noted, 355 residents of Khura and Segev Shalom who had joined the program between December 2007 and December 2009 were interviewed for the quantitative analysis.

- ◆ ***Gender:*** The participant profile differed in the two localities. In Khura, two-thirds of the participants were male, whereas in Segev Shalom, the situation was the opposite.
- ◆ ***Age and family status:*** The program participants were young – almost half of them were under 25 and, accordingly, 45% were unmarried and 53% did not have children. The participants in Khura were younger – about 60% were under 25, compared with 36% in Segev Shalom.
- ◆ ***Education:*** The largest group of participants (38%) had 12 or more years of education and a matriculation certificate or non-academic post-high-school diploma. Twenty-seven percent had completed high school without matriculation. Sixteen percent had 9–11 years of schooling and 16% had no more than 8 years. Only 4% of the applicants were college graduates.

As expected, the younger participants had a higher level of education than the older ones. Fifty-four percent of those under 25, 41% of those in the 25–34 age group, and only 11 % of those aged 35+ had a certificate of matriculation or higher education.

The men were better educated than the women – 77% had 12 or more years of education. However, the percentage of women with a certificate of matriculation or higher education was a little higher – 45%, vs. 39% of the men. Nevertheless, 23% of the women, compared with 9% of the men, had no more than 8 years of schooling. The women in Khura were slightly better educated than those in Segev Shalom.

- ◆ ***Command of Hebrew:*** In general, the participants reported that they had a good command of Hebrew – slightly more participants did so in Khura than in Segev Shalom. This might be because a higher percentage of men than women considered their Hebrew was good and, as noted, two-thirds of the participants in Khura were men.

- ◆ **Computer skills:** About half of the participants reported that they could use at least three of the four most popular applications: Word, Excel, e-mail and the Internet. In Khura, the men and women assessed their computer skills similarly, while in Segev Shalom, the women's assessment of their ability was far lower – not only than that of the men in their locality, but also than that of the women in Khura.
- ◆ **Employment experience:** Twenty-three percent of the participants were working when they registered at Maavarim. A further 35% were not working when they registered, but had been employed for a certain amount of time in the previous two years. In other words, 58% of them were in the labor market or not far from it timewise. In contrast, 20% had never worked. Approximately 90% of the participants with absolutely no work experience were women, about half of them under the age of 25, who had just completed their studies or who were taking care of small children. The women in Segev Shalom were closer to the labor market – almost half of them were working when they registered for the program or had worked during the previous two years, compared with only a quarter of the women in Khura.
- ◆ **Occupation:** Twenty-seven percent of the participants – 23% of the men and 30% of the women – reported that they had a profession or trade. Of these, 45% of the men and about 30% of the women had an academic, professional or technical occupation (e.g., engineer, teacher, software instructor, youth worker, pharmacist). A large proportion of the men (38%) were skilled workers (e.g., plumbers, mechanics, electricians, cooks). Among the skilled women, a large proportion (44%) worked in sales and services (e.g., hairdressers and caregivers).

The percentage of skilled women in Khura was greater than in Segev Shalom – 41% vs. 25%. Apparently, more young women in Khura had learned a trade but had not had time to work in it.

- ◆ **Driving license and car ownership/access to a car:** A driving license and access to a car can be considered employment resources in the local labor market where job opportunities are limited and public transport to and from the locality is limited and/or irregular. Forty-seven percent of the participants reported having a driving license and 63% of them had access to a vehicle. As expected, the percentage of men with a driving license and access to a vehicle was much higher than the percentage of women. The differences were more marked in Khura, perhaps because Khura is more traditional and Segev Shalom more modern (according to the staff of Maavarim).

#### ***b. Contact between Participants and the Maavarim Center***

- ◆ **Sources of information:** The primary sources of information for most of the participants were people connected to the program – the Center staff (27%), the community center staff (27%)<sup>2</sup> and members of the *Reshet Meshatefet* (20%).

---

<sup>2</sup> Since the Maavarim Center is located in the community center, the participants may not have made the distinction between the Maavarim staff and community center employees.

- ◆ **Reason for registering at Maavarim:** The reasons most commonly reported by the men were practical: They wanted the Center to find jobs for them (88%) and they wanted information about job offers (79%). The women, too, came mainly for the Center to find them jobs (69%). Only a few (4%) came to get information about job offers. Cultural restrictions affect their ability to look for work independently and therefore they needed the Center to actually place them in jobs. They expressed an additional need – to study – and this was reflected in their wish to get information about scholastic studies (19%) and/or vocational studies (9%) and to participate in courses (11%).
- ◆ **Services received by Maavarim participants:** The self-reports reveal that the main services received were one-on-one discussions on employment-related topics (82%), referrals to places of work (69%), information about job offers, employees' rights, and vocational training courses (71%, 56% and 69%, respectively), acquiring job-hunting skills and employment counseling (37% and 38%, respectively).  
The services the participants received evidently met their needs. Among the men who focused on finding work, 82% reported that they were referred to a specific place of work, almost all received information about job offers, employees' rights and vocational training courses, and 65% acquired job-hunting skills. Approximately 60% of the women reported that they were referred to a specific job. Some 50% received information about vocational training courses and 25% received information about other study options. Altogether, 19% of the women were referred to at least one type of course, 12% to theoretical courses and 12% to specific vocational courses. However, not all the women referred to courses did indeed take them or complete them.

### **c. Program Outcomes – Employment and Studies**

- ◆ **Employment/study status at time of interview:** 47% of the participants were employed at the time of interview, about 2.5 years after the start of the program. Twenty-eight percent were working only and 19% combined work with study. Twelve percent were studying only and 24% were neither working nor studying, but were looking for work. Only 17% were not working, nor studying, nor looking for work.

The differences between men and women were essentially the differences in the employment rates – 59% of the men vs. 35% of the women – and, consequently, in the percentages of participants not working, nor studying, nor looking for work – 30% of the women vs. a mere 4% of the men.

- ◆ **Increased employment:** Increased employment was measured by several parameters:
  - An increase in the employment rate of all the participants between two points in time: The number of individuals employed at the time of interview had increased by 24 percentage points since the start of the program – from 82 people (23%) to 166 people (47%).
  - The increase in the percentage of participants who had worked at any time since the start of the program – from 23% to 70%, an increase of 47 percentage points.

- The percentage of those who were not employed at the start of the program and were integrated into employment: 39% of the 273 participants who were not employed when they joined the program were working at the time of interview (50% of the men and 30% of the women). An additional 24%, although not working at the time of the interview, had worked since their first visit to Maavarim – 31% of the men and 19% of the women. Altogether, 63% of those who were not employed when they joined the program did work at some time after joining the program – 81% of the men and 49% of the women.
  - Six percent of all the participants (the percentage was similar among both men and women) were employed when they joined the program and changed their jobs. Due to the low figures, they were not included in the analysis.
  - In the absence of a control group, the increased employment cannot definitively be attributed to the program. However, the information about implementation of the program allows us to assume that a considerable increase in the employment rate following participation in the program does indicate the impact of the program, even though it is not possible to quantify the extent of the impact.
- ◆ ***Characteristics of participants whom the program placed in work at any time vs. those who were not placed:*** The program had greater success placing men in work than women.
- In a separate analysis of the men's group, it was found that those who succeeded in integrating at work had a higher education and a better command of Hebrew than those who did not and had basic computer skills. They had fewer health restrictions affecting their ability to work and were closer to the labor market. A higher percentage of them had their own car or access to one.
  - The women who succeeded in integrating into employment had a higher education than those who did not, were closer to the labor market and more of them owned cars. They also differed from the others in the number of children under the age of 18 living at home. Unexpectedly, there was no distinction between the groups with regard to having children under the age of 2 or 5 at home or to the number of children in any age category. In the case of married women, a certain difference was found with regard to their husbands' work: the husbands of women who were integrated into employment were characterized by a slightly higher rate of unemployment (40% vs. 30%, respectively).
  - Further clarification comes from the main reasons given by the women themselves for not working throughout the period they were registered at Maavarim: objections from the men in their families (husbands, brothers, fathers) to their going out to work (18%); no suitable jobs – because the women were unskilled, the jobs available were physically demanding or temporary, the pay was low or the hours inconvenient (18%); they were despondent after attempts to find work, which certainly decreased their motivation (28%).

- ◆ ***Characteristics of the jobs of newly employed participants*** (those who were not working when they registered at Maavarim but subsequently found employment):
  - Occupation: 10% of the newly employed participants were placed in academic, liberal and technical positions, 24% in clerical, sales and service jobs, 28% in skilled work and 38% in unskilled jobs. The men were placed mainly in jobs for skilled workers, e.g., warehouseman, carpenter, car mechanic (44%) and unskilled work such as putting out vegetables in supermarkets, washing dishes in restaurants and assistant gardener (29%). The women were placed mainly in unskilled work, e.g., packing vegetables, picking flowers, cleaning (49%) and sales and services, e.g., caregivers for the elderly, sick and children (28%).  
An analysis of the occupations of the newly employed by education revealed that education was somewhat beneficial: 22% of the most educated group (with a matriculation certificate or higher) – 18% of the men and 26% of the women – were placed in academic, professional or technical positions. However, 40% (35% of the men and 44% of the women) were placed in unskilled work.
  - Patterns of employment and type of employer: 75% of the newly employed participants were salaried and employed directly by their place of work (i.e., not through an agency). Most of the salaried men (55%) worked for Jewish employers, while the opposite was true for the women – most (57%) worked for Bedouin employers. A large percentage of the women were employed by a manpower agency (35%). The percentage of self-employed participants was low (5%), and slightly more common among women working at home.
  - Hourly wage: 31% of the wage earners reported that they were earning less than the minimum wage (NIS 20.70 per hour); 55% reported that their wages were between the minimum wage and 1.5 times that amount. The women reported significantly lower wages than the men did, one reason being that some of them did not work regularly, e.g., they worked for 10 days a month, mainly in agriculture or as substitute teachers or preschool teachers.
  - Job satisfaction: 65% of the newly employed participants said in interview that they were satisfied – even very satisfied – with their work. The men were more satisfied than the women – 71% vs. 55%, respectively.
- ◆ ***Childcare arrangements for working mothers:*** The data below apply to all mothers who were employed at some time since they registered at Maavarim. Seventy-nine women had at least one child under 5. Fifty-two percent of them were working when the data were collected, or were working when they registered at Maavarim, or had worked since joining. The percentage was similar among the 65 women who had at least one child aged 5–11 (55%). The data on childcare arrangements are presented by the age of the child and the unit used in the analysis is the child (one mother could have several children of different ages).
  - With regard to the frameworks for the 56 children aged 0–4 while their mothers were at work, 48% had a paid childcare arrangement, like a nanny, home-based childcare service or preschool and 43% were in informal settings, e.g., cared for by the father or another

family member. In a few cases, the children were looked after by an older sibling or the mother worked at home.

- With regard to the afterschool/preschool frameworks for the 61 children aged 5–11 while their mothers were at work, none of the children were in afterschool programs or afternoon enrichment programs, which are rare in the Bedouin sector. In some cases, the father or another relative helped out (8% and 30% of the children, respectively). Older siblings played a key role in childcare (26% of the children). In some cases, no arrangement was necessary since the mother worked at home, or worked part time or was a teacher, which allowed her to be home when the children came home from preschool or school (16%). Note that 16% of the children were left alone.
- ◆ ***Study or wish to study:*** Studies can be considered an intermediate outcome of the program. The rationale is that study of any kind – academic, non-academic post-high school, matriculation studies, completion of 10 or 12 years of schooling, literacy, and professional training – can all promote integration into employment in general and in particular into "better" jobs, especially for the younger population.
  - Twenty-one percent of the participants were studying at the time of interview (some were combining study with work): 53% of them were studying at university or an academic college, 21% were in a vocational training program, 16% were completing 10 or 12 years of schooling, and 9% were studying for matriculation or were in a pre-academic preparatory program.
  - At the time of interview, 79% were not studying. Of these, 39% (i.e., 31% of all the participants) reported that they would like to study: 37% of those interested in studying wanted to go to university/academic college, 38% wanted vocational training, 13% wanted to study in order to acquire an equivalent high-school diploma, and 12% wanted to study for matriculation or enroll in a pre-academic preparatory program.

#### ***d. Job Seeking***

- ◆ ***Percentage of jobseekers:*** 70 men and 119 women of the program participants were not employed at the time of interview. Of these, 71% of the men and 46% of the women reported that they were actively seeking employment.
- ◆ ***Difficulties finding work:*** An analysis of the responses to three questions – although each related to a different context and was referred to a different group – allows us to learn about the difficulties facing Bedouin men and women in their attempts to find work. The first question referred directly to difficulties finding work and was put to all participants who were not working at the time of interview. The second question was put to those who were not working when they registered at Maavarim (most of them women). The third question had to do with the reasons for stopping work and was put to those who had, after they had registered at Maavarim, stopped working at one place of work and moved to another, or had not found another job. The responses reveal 4 types of difficulty:
  - Inappropriate job offers: Men and women described the offers as "inappropriate" in the sense of the pay being low, the work being hard physically or the position being

temporary. In addition, men noted the demand for professional experience, the difficulty finding part-time work that would enable them to combine work and study, and health-related difficulties. Women noted other factors such as working hours that were too late for them to get home for the children after school or preschool and location that was too far from home and transportation difficulties.

- Lack of human capital: About 75% of the men who were not employed at the time of interview attributed their difficulty finding work to the fact that they had no occupational skills and, furthermore, to inadequate education and command of Hebrew.
- Lack of suitable childcare arrangements in several respects, i.e., the hours had to fit in with the working hours of the mothers and the cost had to be lower than the mothers' wages. An analysis of childcare arrangements for working Bedouin mothers reveals that the main difficulty was the absence of afternoon programs for preschoolers and children in the lower grades of elementary school, more than the lack of home-based childcare services or daycare centers for smaller children.
- The cultural restrictions on working women: The objections of men in the families to the women going out to work, working outside the locality, travelling out of the locality unaccompanied and/or working in the company of men.

***e. Participants' Assessment of the Contribution of the Program and Needs for Additional Assistance***

- ◆ A third of the participants reported that the program met their expectations to a great extent, just over a third noted a moderate extent and just under a third reported that the program did not meet their expectations or met their expectations to a small extent.
- ◆ More men than women, and more residents of Khura than of Segev Shalom reported that the program met their expectations.
- ◆ With regard to the contribution of the program, 46%–57% reported that the Maavarim Center had strengthened their motivation to work and study in various frameworks, had strengthened their self-confidence in their ability to find work and had added to their job-seeking and vocational skills.
- ◆ A quarter of the respondents noted that they needed more assistance than they were given at Maavarim, chiefly:
  - Help finding suitable work and support when starting a new job (74%)
  - Improved employment resources: a greater number and variety of courses, including literacy programs and courses giving recognized diplomas (18%)
  - Financial assistance to pay for studies (11%)
  - Provision of funding and information to help participants open their own business (8%).

The study findings have been presented to the study steering committee and the steering committee of the regional employment center for Bedouin in the Negev. The information and insights about the participants' need for assistance and the work procedures with agencies within



and outside of the Bedouin localities are helping with the planning and operation of new locality-based centers. The study is also contributing to the development of the continuation of the program.

## Acknowledgments

We would above all, like to thank Fahed Al-Assibi, director of the Maavarim Center, for his assistance in introducing us – the researchers – to the program participants, for his painstaking efforts to familiarize us with the program and the environment in which it is implemented, and for his invaluable comments and insights on the draft of this report. Thanks also to Kassim Sariyieh, head of the Unit for Individual Service, who provided important information and was instrumental in obtaining cooperation from the participants.

We are grateful to the respondents who were kind enough to give us their time and share their knowledge and experience with us – members of the Maavarim staff: Irit Ramon-Hayyun, national director of the Maavarim Program, Munira Abu-Rimsheh, head of the Community Unit when we began the study, Riyyad Atauna and Khalil Jarbiya, the mentors at Khura and Segev Shalom, Talal Saad, head of employer relations at the Center, the mayors of Khura and Segev Shalom, Dr. Muhammad Al-Nabari and Amer Abu Maamer; members of the board of the Maavarim Center: Ali Abu-Alkiayan, director of the Khura community center, Ran Weizmann, director of the Segev Shalom community center, Shahde Jabbur and Khir Al-Din-Elbaz, directors of the social service departments in Khura and Segev Shalom; members of the steering committee: Tanya Liff of the National Insurance Institute, Mahmoud Abu-Afash of the Employment Service, Atef Abu-Ajaj of AJEEC, Dr. Shaher Al-Makawi of Ahad – Academics for the Advancement of Arab Society in the Negev, and Baruch Sugarman of the Ministry of Social Affairs and Social Services; members of the *Reshet Meshatefet* in Khura and Segev Shalom (too numerous to thank individually) and Naifa Al-Nabari, head of the Council of Women in Khura; and lastly, all the residents of Khura and Segev Shalom who participated in the program.

We wish to thank our colleague Suzan Hassan Daher at the Myers-JDC-Brookdale Institute, who facilitated the focus groups in Khura and Segev Shalom; Dr. Sigal Shelach and Ruthi Yaron of TEVET; and Fahed Al-Assibi for their helpful insights on the draft of this report. Finally, thanks to Mati Moyal and Jenny Rosenfeld, who edited the report, and Leslie Klineman, who prepared it for publication

# Table of Contents

|   |           |
|---|-----------|
| Foreword  | 1         |
| <b>Part 1: Evaluation of the Implementation</b>                           | <b>3</b>  |
| 1. Introduction   | 3         |
| 2. Study Design   | 3         |
| 3. Findings   | 4         |
| 3.1 Process of Setting up the Maavarim Center at Khura-Segev Shalom       | 4         |
| 3.2 Organizational and Professional Infrastructure of the Maavarim Center | 5         |
| 3.3 Contacts and Partnerships   | 16        |
| 3.4 Teamwork Difficulties   | 17        |
| 4. Discussion   | 18        |
| 4.1 Successes   | 19        |
| 4.2 Difficulties  | 20        |
| <b>Part 2: Evaluation of the Outcomes for the Program Participants</b>    | <b>24</b> |
| 1. Introduction   | 24        |
| 2. Fieldwork  | 25        |
| 2.1 Study Population  | 25        |
| 2.2 Difficulties Conducting the Interviews and Ways to Resolve Them       | 25        |
| 2.3 Results of the Fieldwork  | 25        |
| 3. Demographic Characteristics, Resources and Barriers to Employment      | 26        |
| 3.1 Demographic Characteristics   | 26        |
| 3.2 Resources and Barriers to Employment                                  | 27        |
| 4. Participants' Contact with the Maavarim Center                         | 29        |
| 4.1 First Source of Information about the Program                         | 29        |
| 4.2 Reasons for Applying to Maavarim                                      | 30        |
| 4.3 Services Received by Participants at the Maavarim Center              | 31        |
| 5. Outcomes of the Program – Employment and Studies                       | 32        |
| 5.1 Employment-Study Status at Time of Interview                          | 32        |
| 5.2 Increased Employment  | 34        |
| 5.3 Patterns of Change in Employment Status                               | 34        |
| 5.4 Characteristics of Jobs of Newly Placed Participants                  | 37        |
| 5.5 Childcare Arrangements for Working Mothers                            | 41        |
| 5.6 Participants Enrolled in Study Frameworks and those Wishing to Study  | 42        |
| 5.7 Job Search  | 43        |
| 5.8 Volunteerism  | 44        |
| 5.9 Difficulties Finding Work   | 45        |
| 6. Focus Groups of Bedouin Women in Khura and Segev Shalom                | 47        |
| 6.1 Opinions in the Bedouin Community about Working Women                 | 47        |
| 6.2 Additional Difficulties for Working Bedouin Women                     | 48        |
| 6.3 How the Women Cope with Work  | 49        |

|  |    |
|--|----|
| 6.4 Implications for Working Women                             | 49 |
| 6.5 Work Aspirations   | 50 |
| 7. Participants' Assessment of the Contribution of the Program | 51 |
| 7.1 Contribution of the Program                                | 51 |
| 7.2 Additional Assistance Needed                               | 52 |
| 7.3 Positive Aspects of the Program, as Noted by Participants  | 53 |
| 7.4 Areas in Need of Improvement, as Noted by Participants     | 54 |
| 8. Discussion  | 54 |
| 8.1 Employment   | 55 |
| 8.2 Study  | 55 |
| 8.3 Gender-based Differences                                   | 55 |
| 8.4 Contribution of the Program                                | 56 |
| Appendix I: Interviews   | 59 |
| Appendix II: The <i>Reshet Meshatefet</i>                      | 60 |
| 1. The Sample  | 60 |
| 2. The Study Instruments                                       | 60 |
| 3. Findings  | 60 |
| 4. Conclusion  | 65 |
| Appendix III: Employment of Women                              | 67 |

## List of Tables

### Part 2: Evaluation of the Outcomes for the Program Participants

#### 1. Introduction

|   |    |
|---|----|
| Table 1: Distribution of Interviews, by Gender and Locality | 25 |
| Table 2: Reasons for Not Conducting Interviews              | 26 |

#### 3. Demographic Characteristics, Resources and Barriers to Employment

|   |    |
|---|----|
| Table 3: Demographic Characteristics of the Participants, by Locality and by Gender | 26 |
|---|----|

#### 4. Participants' Relationship with the Maavarim Center

|  |    |
|--|----|
| Table 4: Resources for Employment of the Participants, by Locality and by Gender                     | 27 |
| Table 5: First Source of Information about the Maavarim Center, by Locality                          | 30 |
| Table 6: Reasons for Registering at Maavarim, by Gender  | 30 |
| Table 7: Services Received at the Maavarim Center according to Participants' Self-Reports, by Gender | 31 |

#### 5. Outcomes of the Program – Employment and Studies

|   |    |
|---|----|
| Table 8: Newly Placed Men and Women, by Time Elapsed since Registering at Maavarim  | 35 |
| Table 9: Resources and Barriers to Employment for Men and Women with Positive Patterns of Change, vs. Those with No/Negative Patterns of Change | 36 |

|   |  |    |
|---|--|----|
| Table 10:   | Family Characteristics of Men and Women with Positive Patterns of Change, vs. Those with No/Negative Patterns of Change                              | 37 |
| Table 11:   | Characteristics of Jobs in which Participants have been Placed, by Gender  | 39 |
| Table 12:   | Occupations of the Newly Placed Participants, by Education and Gender  | 40 |
| Table 13:   | Frameworks for Children under 5 while Mother is Working  | 42 |
| Table 14:   | After Preschool/School Frameworks for Children Aged 5–11 of Working Mothers  | 42 |
| Table 15:   | Job-Hunting Channels, by Gender  | 42 |
| Table 16:   | Difficulties Finding Work, by Gender   | 44 |
| Table 17:   | Main Reason for Not Working in the Period Following Registration at Maavarim, by Gender  | 45 |
| Table 18:   | Main Reason for Stopping Work, by Gender   | 46 |
| <b>7. Participants' Assessment of the Contribution of the Program</b> |  |    |
| Table 19:   | Extent to which the Program Met the Expectations of the Participants, by Gender  | 51 |
| Table 20:   | Extent to which the Program Met the Expectations of the Participants, by Locality  | 51 |
| Table 21:   | Extent to which the Maavarim Center Helped Participants by Strengthening their Motivation and Self-Confidence and Imparting Skills                   | 52 |
| Table 22:   | Participants who Consider that the Maavarim Center Helped Them by Strengthening their Motivation and Self-Confidence and Imparting Skills, by Gender | 52 |
| Table III-1:  | Sociodemographic Characteristics of the Women who were Not Employed and who were Seeking Work vs. Those who were Not Seeking Work                    | 67 |
| Table III-2:  | Resources and Barriers to Work of the Women who were Not Employed and who were Seeking Work vs. Those who were Not Seeking Work                      | 68 |

## List of Figures

|           |   |    |
|-----------|---|----|
| Figure 1: | Employment/Study Status at Date of Interview                                    | 33 |
| Figure 2: | Employment/Study Status at Date of Interview – Men and Women                    | 33 |
| Figure 3: | Changes in Employment Status between Joining Program and Date of Interview      | 35 |
| Figure 4: | Studies – Participants Studying and those Wishing to Study and Study Frameworks | 43 |